

FINAL Evaluation Findings
Ohio Coastal Management Program
November 2003 to May 2007

April 2008



Office of Ocean and Coastal Resource Management
National Ocean Service
National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration
United States Department of Commerce

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	1
II.	PROGRAM REVIEW PROCEDURES.....	2
	A. Overview	2
	B. Document Review and Issue Development	2
	C. Site Visit to Ohio.....	3
III.	COASTAL MANAGEMENT PROGRAM DESCRIPTION.....	4
IV.	REVIEW FINDINGS, ACCOMPLISHMENTS AND RECOMMENDATIONS.....	7
	A. Operation and Management.....	7
	1. Internal Office Processes	7
	2. Communications and Outreach.....	8
	B. Public Access	9
	1. Mill Creek Greenway Connector Trail	9
	2. Dike 14.....	9
	3. Lakewood Park Lakefront Revitalization Project.....	10
	4. CELCP Implementation.....	10
	C. Coastal Habitat	10
	1. Cuyahoga River West Bank Preservation.....	11
	2. Euclid Creek Restoration Sub-Watershed Plan	11
	D. Water Quality	11
	1. Clean Marinas	11
	2. Nonpoint Source Pollution and Watershed Management.....	12
	3. Lake Erie Balanced Growth Initiative	13
	E. Coastal Dependent Uses.....	13
	1. Rehabilitation Study of the Former U.S. Coast Guard Station.....	13
	2. Bayfront Corridor Extension	14
	F. Government Coordination and Decision-making.....	14
	1. Integrated Management Team and Policies and Programs Committee	14
	2. Submerged Lands Leasing Program	15
	3. Lake Erie Shore Erosion Management Plan and Coastal Design Manual.....	15
	4. Public Participation.....	16
	5. Coastal Resources Advisory Committee	16
	6. Coordination with Coastal Partners	16
	7. Compliance Monitoring.....	17
V.	CONCLUSION	18
VI.	APPENDICES	19
	Appendix A: Summary of Accomplishments and Recommendations	
	Appendix B: Response to Previous Findings	
	Appendix C: Persons and Institutions Contacted	
	Appendix D: Persons Attending the Public Meeting	
	Appendix E: NOAA’s Response to Written Comments	

I. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Section 312 of the Coastal Zone Management Act of 1972 (CZMA), as amended, requires the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration's (NOAA's) Office of Ocean and Coastal Resource Management (OCRM) to conduct periodic evaluations of the performance of states and territories coastal management programs. This review examined the operation and management of the State of Ohio's Coastal Management Program (OCMP) for the period from November 2003 through May 2007.

This document describes the evaluation findings of the Director of NOAA's OCRM with respect to OCMP during the review period. These evaluation findings include discussions of major accomplishments as well as recommendations for program improvement. The evaluation concludes that OCMP is successfully implementing and enforcing its federally-approved coastal management program, adhering to the terms of the Federal financial assistance awards, and addressing the coastal management needs identified in Section 303(2)(A) through (K) of the CZMA.

The evaluation team documented a number of OCMP accomplishments during this review period. These include accomplishments in the operation and management of OCMP operations in both grant processes and in communication and outreach; support of the development of public access projects along the Lake Erie coast; preservation and restoration activities; activities in developing a clean marina program and for its nonpoint source pollution and watershed management activities; the rehabilitation of a former Coast Guard station and in the development of the master pedestrian and bicycle trail for the bayfront corridor of the City of Sandusky; and the development and dissemination of the Coastal Atlas.

The evaluation team also identified areas where the OCMP could be strengthened. These include Program Suggestions to improve operations and management, develop a user friendly program document, and reconstitute the Coastal Resources Advisory Committee. The Necessary Action bolsters ODNR's efforts in compliance monitoring and enforcement.

II. PROGRAM REVIEW PROCEDURES

A. OVERVIEW

The National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration (NOAA) began its review of the OCMP in March 2007. The §312 evaluation process involves four distinct components:

- An initial document review and identification of specific issues of concern;
- A site visit to Ohio, including interviews and public meetings;
- Development of draft evaluation findings; and
- Preparation of the final evaluation findings, partly based on comments from Ohio regarding the content and timetables of recommendations specified in the draft document.

The recommendations made by this evaluation appear in boxes and bold type and follow the findings section where facts relevant to the recommendation are discussed. The recommendations may be of two types:

Necessary Actions address programmatic requirements of the CZMA's implementing regulations and of the OCMP approved by NOAA. These must be carried out by the date(s) specified;

Program Suggestions denote actions which OCRM believes would improve the program, but which are not mandatory at this time. If no dates are indicated, the program is expected to have considered these Program Suggestions by the time of the next CZMA §312 evaluation.

A complete summary of accomplishments and recommendations is outlined in Appendix A.

Failure to address Necessary Actions may result in future finding of non-adherence and the invoking of interim sanctions, as specified in CZMA §312(c). Program Suggestions that must be reiterated in consecutive evaluations to address continuing problems may be elevated to Necessary Actions. The findings in this document will be considered by NOAA in making future financial assistance award decisions relative to the OCMP.

B. DOCUMENT REVIEW AND ISSUE DEVELOPMENT

The evaluation team reviewed a wide variety of documents prior to the site visit, including: (1) 2003 OCMP §312 evaluation findings; (2) federally approved Environmental Impact Statement and program documents; (3) financial assistance awards and work products; (4) annual performance reports; (5) official correspondence; and (6) relevant publications on natural resource management issues in Ohio.

Based on this review and on discussions with OCRM, the following issues were identified:

- OCMP’s major accomplishments during the review period;
- Effectiveness in permitting, monitoring, reporting and enforcing the core authorities that form the legal basis of the OCMP;
- Implementation of State and Federal consistency authority;
- Extent to which OCMP is monitoring, reporting and submitting program changes to OCRM;
- Status of OCMP’s grant tasks and reporting;
- OCMP’s coordination with other Federal, State and local agencies and programs;
- Effectiveness of local technical assistance programs in assisting coastal communities;
- Status of public access opportunities in the coastal zone;
- OCMP’s approach to emerging local and regional coastal management issues;
- OCMP’s advancement of the CZMA goals set forth in § 303(2); and
- The manner in which the State has addressed the recommendations contained in the previous §312 evaluation findings issued in 2005. OCMP’s assessment of how it has responded to each of the recommendations in the 2005 evaluation findings is located in Appendix B

C. SITE VISIT TO OHIO

Notification of the scheduled evaluation was sent to the OCMP, relevant environmental agencies, the congressional representative, and regional newspapers. In addition, a notice of NOAA’s “Intent to Evaluate” was published in the Federal Register on February 27, 2007.

The site visit to Ohio was conducted on May 14 through 18, 2007. The evaluation team consisted of John H. McLeod, Evaluation Team Leader, OCRM National Policy and Evaluation Division (NPED); Katarina Trojnar, NPED; Liz Mountz, Coastal Management Specialist, OCRM Coastal Programs Division; and Jeff Willis, Deputy Director, Rhode Island Coastal Management Program. During the site visit, the evaluation team met with representatives of State and Federal agencies, interest group representatives, and private citizens. Appendix C lists people and institutions contacted during this review.

As required by the CZMA, NOAA held an advertised public meeting on May 16, 2007, at 7:00 p.m., in the Erie County Commissioners Chambers. The public meeting gave members of the general public the opportunity to express their opinions about the overall operation and management of OCMP. Appendix D lists individuals who registered at the meeting. NOAA’s response to written comments submitted during this review is summarized in Appendix E.

The OCMP staff members were crucial in setting up meetings and arranging logistics for the evaluation site visit. Their support is most gratefully acknowledged.

III. COASTAL MANAGEMENT PROGRAM DESCRIPTION

The Ohio Coastal Management Program (OCMP) was approved by NOAA on May 16, 1997. The OCMP is implemented under the authority of the Ohio Coastal Management Act, passed in 1988, under the Ohio Revised Code Chapter 1506. In accordance with that statute, the Ohio Department of Natural Resources (ODNR) is designated as the lead agency to cooperate with other State agencies and political subdivisions in implementing OCMP through a networked approach. It provides for management of coastal erosion areas and the State's public trust property of Lake Erie and the lands underlying its waters, establishes advisory councils and the Lake Erie Protection fund, and provides for grants to local communities, nonprofit organizations, and educational institutions for projects to enhance management of coastal resources.

Within ODNR, the Office of Coastal Management (OCM) is charged with administering the OCMP. The ODNR created the OCM in 2002 during a programmatic reorganization; this administrative reorganization was formally submitted to NOAA as a routine program change and approved in 2007. The OCM is responsible for: administering the Ohio Coastal Management Program and coordinating with agencies within the networked program; implementing federal consistency, shore structure permitting, and coastal erosion area permitting; conducting submerged land administration; providing technical assistance, monitoring and mapping coastal resources; and administering the coastal management assistance grant program.

Based on the State of Ohio's existing regulatory framework for managing coastal area activities, this structure serves as the basis of OCMP's authorities and policies and establishes an institutional framework to address coastal resources and issues in a comprehensive manner. The purpose of OCMP is to integrate management of the land and water resources of the coastal area in order to preserve, protect, develop, restore and enhance these resources. OCMP provides a framework to guide public and private activities and cooperative endeavors in the coastal area. OCMP is composed of 41 policy statements within the following nine issue areas:

- coastal erosion and flooding
- water quality
- ecologically sensitive areas
- ports and shore area development
- recreation and cultural resources
- fish and wildlife management
- environmental quality
- energy and mineral resources
- water quantity

These coastal management policies, found in Chapter 5 of the OCMP document, promote the wise management of those land and water uses having direct and significant impacts upon the

Lake Erie coastal area. Certain policies focus upon the protection of significant natural areas, such as wetlands; other policies have been established in an effort to simplify governmental procedures and foster agency cooperation regarding coastal activities.

The Ohio coastal area includes all of the waters of Lake Erie to the international boundary with Canada, the islands in the Lake, and adjacent shorelands within Ohio. The inland coastal management boundary includes all shorelands subject to erosion or flooding, estuarine areas and wetlands, and other areas where the use of which may directly and significantly affect Lake Erie waters. The inland extent of the boundary varies based on the biogeographic features of the area. For example, the boundary extends inland approximately 16 miles along the Maumee River, while in urban areas, the coastal boundary generally is less than a half mile from the shore. The inland boundary was developed based on substantial public input.

As part of the Nation's "fourth seacoast" (the Great Lakes), Ohio's Lake Erie coast consists of 312 miles of mainland and island shores, as well as 3,277 square miles of water. Approximately 41 percent of the residents of the State live within the Lake Erie basin. Approximately 33,000 acres of valuable coastal wetlands in Ohio support at least 250 species of nesting birds, including the bald eagle. Shallow waters in the island and bay region provide fish spawning grounds and nurseries, sustaining a commercial and sport fishing industry.

Lake Erie divides naturally into three major basins: western, central and eastern. The western basin, extending from Toledo to Huron, includes the Lake Erie Islands of Ohio. The largest and most developed islands are Kelleys Island and North, Middle and South Bass Islands. Rattlesnake and Ballast Islands are smaller and privately owned. West Sister and Green Islands are undeveloped and are wildlife refuges. The central basin extends from Sandusky to Erie, Pennsylvania, where the eastern basin begins.

Ohio's portion of the western basin of Lake Erie includes about 450,000 surface acres of water and approximately 137 miles of shoreline. The area has numerous reefs and shoals, rocky islands, and sandy beaches. It is the most productive fish spawning and nursery grounds in the Great Lakes. Maximum water depth in the western basin is 46 feet, with an average depth of 24 feet. Bottom types range from sand and silt to hard packed clay and limestone bedrock.

Ohio's portion of central Lake Erie includes 1,783,000 surface acres of water and approximately 125 miles of shoreline. Maximum depth of the central basin is 80 feet, with an average depth of 56 feet. The bottom is made up of a gravel and shale bedrock covered in most areas by mud and sand.

Lake Erie water levels vary naturally over time in cyclical fluctuations, ranging from the record historical low of 568.31 feet in February 1936 to the record high of 574.16 feet in June 1986. Long-term average level of Lake Erie is 571.16 feet. Lake level varies naturally through precipitation and evaporation in the basin, inflow from the upper Great Lakes via the Detroit River, and outflow into the Niagara River. Although four man-made diversions and two regulatory structures have some minor effect on Great Lakes water levels in general, no water level control structures exist specifically on Lake Erie.

Erosion along the Ohio shore of Lake Erie is a serious problem, especially in areas of high bluffs and erodible sand, clay and till. The two primary erosional processes are wave erosion and mass wasting. Natural factors such as beach distribution, near shore depths, storm frequency, lake level, and shoreline orientation contribute to variations in rates of erosion over time and place to place. Erosion control structures and offshore disposal of sand dredged from harbors also contribute to variations and have exacerbated erosion problems in some areas. Recession rates vary from nominal along dolomite and limestone island areas to as much as 12 feet annually in portions of Lake and Ashtabula counties. Of the 312 miles of shoreline, approximately 157 miles, or 50 percent, are eroding at a rate greater than 0.3 foot per year.

IV. REVIEW FINDINGS, ACCOMPLISHMENTS, AND RECOMMENDATIONS

A. OPERATION AND MANAGEMENT

During the review period strides were made in the operation and management of OCMP operations in both grant processes and in communication and outreach.

1. Internal Office Processes

The OCMP has developed a Coastal Grant Tracking Database that enables staff to more efficiently track and monitor OCMP funded projects. This database has been designed to allow the program to code projects and staff activity according to the national CZM performance indicators system categories, which will increase efficiency in meeting the national indicator reporting requirements. The OCMP is also in the process of converting many office management processes into the new statewide Ohio Administrative Knowledge System (OAKS). The current Coastal Grants Tracking database will integrate into the OAKS system, and the program is planning to develop an additional web-based grants tracking system for Coastal Management Assistance Grants (GMAG) and other subgrant recipients that will interface with OAKS. The OCMP has improved the billing and revenue collection operation procedures for the Submerged Lands Leasing program, resulting in enhanced fiscal efficiency and collection of lease payments.

The OCMP has also developed a grants booklet which summarizes all of the pass-thru grant projects which have been completed since the program's implementation. This grants booklet is a valuable outreach tool that provides a well-organized overview of the variety of projects that have been supported through the coastal program and the various grant programs administered by the OCMP.

ACCOMPLISHMENT: The OCMP has initiated or developed processes that are resulting in sound operation and management in the monitoring and tracking of coastal grants.

The OCMP has worked to improve communications with NOAA as well as with state partners. For example, the OCMP recently updated the format of the required semi-annual progress report in order to improve readability and provide additional information regarding progress towards completion of grant tasks. These changes greatly enhanced NOAA's ability to quickly and easily use the reported program information. In September 2005, the OCMP hosted the Great Lakes Regional CZM meeting, which provided an opportunity for NOAA and the Great Lakes state coastal zone management programs to share information on a variety of topics, including grants management, submerged lands management, and performance measures.

The OCMP has also been working to create a long term strategic plan for the program, developed around five main theme areas: office functions, internal operations, education and outreach, regulatory program, and protection of coastal resources. The Office of Coastal Management has solicited input from the Policies and Programs Coordinating Committee (PPCC), Integrated Management Team (IMT), and Coastal Resources Advisory Council (CRAC) and is in the process of revising and consolidating the goals, strategies and objectives from an earlier draft document.

During the evaluation period several crucial staff positions have been filled and various office operation procedures have been standardized and documented. OCMP staff has attended professional development training on a variety of topics from grants management to soil erosion training. The OCMP is to be commended for developing a strong professional staff with solid expertise in an array of coastal management issues.

2. Communications and Outreach

During the evaluation period, the OCMP developed a short-term outreach plan and has made a concerted effort to meet with local decision-makers through a series of Coastal County Forums as well as other outreach efforts. The Office of Coastal Management's current location along the Lake Erie coast greatly enhances the program's ability to work with key coastal constituents. OCMP staff compiles a daily news summary of articles relating to Lake Erie coastal management issues, and this information is distributed to OCMP staff and coastal partners. The OCMP website is updated frequently and contains useful information for permit applicants and other coastal constituents.

The Coastal Atlas and Grants Booklet provide the OCMP with valuable tools to assist in disseminating information to coastal stakeholders. In particular, the OCMP has received very positive feedback from users of the Ohio Coastal Atlas, including state and local partners, local school districts, and others. The OCMP has also developed the Internet Map Site, an interactive educational tool with various map layers that include recreational sites, navigation channels, land cover, and soil types. The OCMP website includes a direct link to the Internet Map Site.

The OCMP is currently developing a Coastal Design Manual to assist property owners, design consultants, and contractors with designing sound coastal structures and applying for Shore Structure Permits. Implementation of the Lake Erie Shore Erosion Management Plan (LESEMP) will require a strong commitment to communicate and coordinate with federal, state, and local governmental agencies, as well as with shoreline property owners and other coastal stakeholders. Communications and outreach should remain a focus for the OCMP and be prioritized within the program's long term strategic plan, including permitting, submerged lands leasing, grants, and other non-regulatory functions.

ACCOMPLISHMENT: The OCMP has developed a short-term outreach plan and has made a concerted effort to meet with local officials during the review period.

PROGRAM SUGGESTION: The OCMP is encouraged to continue developing and

implementing an office-wide communication plan that includes outreach components as well as continued communication with core constituent groups.

In 2007, NOAA approved a routine program change updating the Ohio Coastal Management Program Document. The OCMP is to be commended for keeping the Program Document up to date, which is essential for federal consistency implementation as well as communicating with networked partners. The OCMP also developed a flowchart detailing the steps involved in reviewing Federal consistency certifications and determinations; this chart, along with an accompanying written description, has been distributed to organizations frequently involved in the federal consistency determination process. The OCMP is considering updating and shortening the program document to make it more “user-friendly.” Alternatively, Ohio might want to consider creating a user-friendly guide in addition to the current program document that would assist the public and other agencies in understanding federal consistency and how this process is implemented in Ohio.

PROGRAM SUGGESTION: The OCMP is encouraged to develop a user-friendly program document stressing the federal consistency process and how it is implemented in Ohio.

B. PUBLIC ACCESS

During the review period the OCMP worked with several local governments to plan and develop expanded access to coastal areas. These projects were funded through the OCMP’s Coastal Management Assistance Grant (CMAG) program, and OCMP staff also provided technical assistance and feedback during project development. All public access projects funded by the OCMP are added to the OCMP’s GIS system allowing the general public easy access to the data through the Internet Map Site. Sites viewed during the site visit review were:

1. Mill Creek Greenway Connector Trail

The Mill Creek Greenway Connector Trail will provide bicycle and pedestrian access to the Ohio and Erie Canal Towpath Trail for approximately 450,000 residents living within the cities of Garfield Heights, Cleveland, and the villages of Cuyahoga Heights and Valley View. The project under this grant accomplished the design and engineering of Phase I of the Connector Trail and construction plans and specifications for use to bid and construct the project. Several studies and reports were required and conducted. It is anticipated that construction on the initial section of Phase I – beginning at the confluence of Mill Creek and the Cuyahoga River and traveling northward to the Ohio and Erie Canal Towpath Trail – will be completed and open to the public in Summer 2007.

2. Dike 14

The Dike 14 project is part of the City of Cleveland’s Master Plan to protect the most critical natural areas of the site and leverage opportunities into a landscape for public use that offers an array of experiences with nature within urbanized Cleveland. Dike 14, a former dredge disposal site that encompasses an 88-acre parcel of steel walled and riprap reinforced made land, has become an important and critical landing for thousands of migratory birds. Because of concerns about what contaminants may be introduced through the dredge soil depositions, the site is closed to the public. Current efforts involve making Dike 14 a publicly accessible site. The Master Plan represents a six-month effort by a variety of stakeholders, including adjacent neighborhoods, nonprofit groups, government agencies, and local naturalists, that have developed the comprehensive Master Plan, including cost estimate, and an action plan. Construction of the Master Plan can begin after a conducted site risk assessment to ensure no risk to human health.

3. Lakewood Park Lakefront Revitalization Project

The Lakewood Park Lakefront Revitalization Project created a new handicap accessible ramp as part of a larger project that resulted in a multi-purpose path throughout Lakewood Park to encourage use by the general public in areas that were previously nearly inaccessible due to disrepair and unsafe conditions. The new ramp and path offer Lakewood residents and visitors an opportunity to enjoy being close to the Lake. This park is the only Lake Erie public access area in the city. Another goal of the project was to re-introduce native plants that over time have been eradicated by the lake action, habitat encroachment, and development. Plant species used include hazelnut, arrowwood, nannyberry, blackhaw, buffaloberry, northern bayberry, common juniper, and flowering crabapple.

ACCOMPLISHMENT: OCMP has strongly supported the development of public access projects along the Lake Erie coast.

4. Coastal and Estuarine Land Conservation Program (CELCP) Implementation

In early 2007, the OCM took over the primary administrative role for the State’s CELCP and the State’s land acquisition projects funded through CELCP. Ohio has also developed and submitted a draft CELCP plan and is currently in the process of finalizing the State’s plan. The CELCP Coordinator within the OCMP oversees the annual CELCP competitive grant application process, including drafting the state request for proposals, review of state applications, coordination and facilitation of grant workshops, coordination of state review committee, project reviews, and compiling state projects for federal application. The office also provides technical assistance for CELCP earmarked projects within the Lake Erie watershed. This assistance is beneficial to both the local recipients and to NOAA and supports the development and improvement of public access to Lake Erie coastal resources.

C. COASTAL HABITAT

The Coastal Management Assistance Grant (CMAG) program described above under the Public Access section also supports local coastal habitat projects. Additionally, in 2001 the OCMP was awarded approximately \$4.5 million under a one-time Great Lakes Coastal Restoration (GLCR) grant. The majority of the projects were awarded and completed during the previous 312 evaluation period; however, several projects remained open within this evaluation period. The OCMP effectively managed this large-scale grant program and supported numerous high quality habitat protection, restoration, and acquisition projects. CMAG and GLCR grant project sites visited during this evaluation were:

1. Cuyahoga River West Bank Preservation

In February 2004, Cleveland Metroparks was awarded a GLCR grant of \$89,500 to acquire riparian conservation easements on the hillside portion of five parcels in the Village of Brooklyn Heights along the Cuyahoga River in Cuyahoga County, Ohio. The parcels collectively represent 17.4 acres and include wooded hillsides, riparian wildlife habitat and approximately 1,500 lineal feet along a railroad right of way on the Cuyahoga River. The protection of these parcels has been deemed critical to preserving the Cuyahoga River riparian corridor, improving the river's water quality and recreational fishing, and enhancing international migratory bird habitat .

In 2005 and 2006, Cleveland Metroparks negotiated and obtained 16.4 acres of conservation easements from four out of five sellers along the Cuyahoga River riparian corridor, of which 13.6 acres were purchased with assistance of the GLCR grant. The conservation easements will significantly benefit the Cuyahoga River by protecting the riparian corridor and the wooded hillside from vulnerable activities such as land clearing, filling, and dumping currently operating nearby. The easements will also protect the hillside vegetation and thus reduce the threat of erosion and improve water quality in the Cuyahoga River as well as Lake Erie. The conservation easements purchased will allow for public access along the river for fishermen and hikers and opens the possibility for potential access to the Towpath Trail, located directly across the river.

2. Euclid Creek Restoration Sub-Watershed Plan

The Euclid Creek Restoration Sub-Watershed Planning Project includes a greenway plan for the lower three miles of Euclid Creek and its coastal interface with Lake Erie as well as a coastal non-point pollution prevention plan for the entire watershed. The project further includes an integrated plan between Wildwood State Park and the Cleveland Metroparks Euclid Creek reservation and seeks to enhance the creek's water resources by considering the ecological, economic, cultural, and social factors in one of Lake Erie's most densely populated coastal regions.

The Lower Euclid Creek Greenway Plan has been identified as a key goal in the Cleveland City-wide Plan of 2007. Its implementation has begun by developing of numerous funding proposals on several projects identified in the plan.

ACOMPLISHMENT: OCMP partnered with local organizations to carry out preservation and restoration activities during the review period.

D. WATER QUALITY

1. Clean Marinas

OCMP has supported the development of a Clean Marina Program that adheres to control measures and practices in shoreline stabilization, stormwater runoff, fueling station design, fish waste, and petroleum control management measures. The Program has been developed and implemented by the Ohio Sea Grant, in coordination with ODNR's Division of Soil and Water Conservation and several other state agency and industry partners. The Clean Marinas Coordinator is housed within the OCM office in Sandusky.

The Ohio Clean Marinas Program has implemented an extensive education and outreach program and developed a comprehensive Clean Marinas Best Management Practices Guidebook. The Guidebook outlines specific practices that marina operators should implement to mitigate impacts to water quality and habitat from marina operation and maintenance, boat operation and maintenance, and marina siting and construction of both new and expanding marinas. The Ohio Clean Marinas Program provides technical assistance to marinas interested in implementing the CMP, and certifies qualified marinas as Clean Marinas. Certified Clean Marinas receive recognition through a certification and a flag to fly at the marina; authorization to use the Ohio Clean Marinas logo on letterhead and in advertising; and attention on the Clean Marina website and public displays.

The Clean Marinas Program is meeting its goal in establishing 40 Clean Marinas by June 30, 2007. To date, the Clean Marina Program has 26 certified Clean Marinas, and an additional 22 have taken the pledge to become Clean Marinas, which is the first step in the certification process. The Ohio Clean Marina Program has also taken the lead in developing a shrink wrap recycling program that provides no-cost shrink wrap collection at more than 50 marinas in several coastal counties. As a result, more than 70 tons of boat shrink-wrap and greenhouse plastics have been recycled into polymer guardrail blocks. The OCMP provides GIS support to the Clean Marina Program for the shrink wrap collection and storm water discharge site surveys.

2. Nonpoint Source Pollution and Watershed Management

OCMP has been implementing a statewide watershed planning program and thereby taking a more comprehensive approach to nonpoint source pollution management. In 2002, the watershed planning guidance was revised to require that all watershed plans within the nonpoint boundary include a strategy to implement all applicable coastal nonpoint program management measures. The Program is voluntary; however, each watershed is encouraged to have an approved watershed plan in place to be eligible for federal and state water quality funding from the USEPA, Ohio EPA, and ODNR.

The Ohio Watershed Coordinator Grants Program also supports watershed coordinator positions, currently 29 in total, throughout the State. The coordinators work with local stakeholders to develop watershed plans and assist local watershed groups with local education and outreach efforts. The OCMP has funded several watershed coordinators working within the coastal nonpoint program boundary, and also funded several projects supporting the implementation of the local watershed plans.

The evaluation team met with watershed coordinators from three watershed initiatives, including the West Creek Watershed, Chagrin River Watershed, and Old Woman Creek Watershed. The Coordinator for West Creek Watershed has worked on a master plan to establish the West Creek Preserve Park. NOAA has subsequently funded the City of Parma project within the West Creek Preserve Park, a \$206,000 land acquisition and stream restoration project, through the Great Lakes Restoration Grant. OCMP has also contracted with the Chagrin River Watershed to collect impervious cover data for the area's subwatersheds. The project complements other previously completed Chagrin River Watershed projects and represents the pilot watershed for the joint state agency efforts to improve consideration of cumulative and secondary impacts during permitting and land use planning actions. OCRM has further contracted with the Chagrin River Watershed Project to develop a centralized, one-stop-shop guide to empower local landowners to better understand the structure and function of the Chagrin River watershed and thereby try to minimize their water quality impacts.

3. Lake Erie Balanced Growth Initiative

The Lake Erie Commission has developed a Lake Erie Balanced Growth Initiative designed to encourage balanced growth in the Lake Erie Watershed. This program contains incentives for local areas to coordinate in developing watershed plans that prioritize areas for conservation and development. The Commission is working with a number of partners to develop a Balanced Growth Training Program and is also supporting several pilot projects. This program complements many of the goals and objectives of the OCMP and the Ohio nonpoint source pollution control program, and the OCMP has provided both funding and staff support for this initiative.

ACCOMPLISHMENT: OCMP activities have supported the development of a clean marina program and nonpoint source pollution and watershed management efforts.

E. COASTAL DEPENDENT USES

1. Rehabilitation Study of the Former US Coast Guard Station

The former United States Coast Guard Station is a unique asset on Cleveland's waterfront that embodies the city's strong maritime history and culture. This historic landmark, built in 1940, is situated on a small peninsula between the Cuyahoga River, Lake Erie, and downtown Cleveland. The site served as headquarters for the US Coast Guard commanding officer and crew until 1976. The City of Cleveland acquired the vacant building in 2003 and has since begun a dialog

with the public to determine the optimal future use of the site. The City is proposing three options for use, including: 1) historically preserve the Coast Guard Station as a Lake Erie Environmental Museum; 2) develop the Coast Guard Station site to its fullest potential with commercial and public uses; and 3) create an educational passive park with monumental ruins of the Coast Guard Station.

Two reports have been produced that summarize the options and raise awareness and inform the community of the current state of the facility as well as the resources needed to save or restore some or all of the buildings.

2. Bayfront Corridor Extension

The City of Sandusky, with the financial assistance of OCMP, undertook the creation and adoption of the Master Pedestrian and Bicycle Trail Plan for the Bayfront Corridor of the City of Sandusky. The trail extends from the east end to the west end of the City and is located as close to the water as possible. The Plan sets forth primary and secondary routes and identifies shoreline acquisition areas, interpretation areas, and aquatic habitat restoration opportunities that the trail could link to. The City has implemented Phase I of the trail and will be implementing Phase II in the summer of 2007.

The total trail mileage for the new sections proposed is 12.01 miles, with an estimated cost of \$7,390,678.11. The completed first phase of the trail adds another 1.3 miles to the trail to make a total trail length of 13.31 miles. The plan further calls out 18 new routes within the completed trail. The Master Pedestrian and Bicycle Trail Plan was approved by the Sandusky City Commission on May 23, 2005, and became effective on June 23, 2005.

ACCOMPLISHMENT: OCMP activities have supported the rehabilitation of a former Coast Guard station and the development of the master pedestrian and bicycle trail for the bayfront corridor of the City of Sandusky.

F. GOVERNMENT COORDINATION AND DECISION-MAKING

1. Integrated Management Team and Policies and Programs Committee

In 2004, the OCMP reactivated the Integrated Management Team (IMT), which consists of key individuals from each division of ODNR with significant coastal responsibilities. The IMT has met regularly quarterly and, along with the Policies and Programs Committee (PPC), has been involved with the OCMP's recent long-term strategic planning efforts.

In August 2006, the OCMP reactivated the PPC, which was created to facilitate communication and coordination among those state agencies that are networked in the OCMP: the Ohio Historical Society, Ohio EPA, the Lake Erie Commission, and the Ohio Departments of Agriculture, Development, Health, Natural Resources, and Transportation. NOAA commends

the OCMP for reactivating the PPC and encourages the program to coordinate PPC meetings with those of the Lake Erie Commission whenever practical, thereby facilitating increased communication regarding Lake Erie coastal issues.

ACCOMPLISHMENT: The OCMP has reactivated the Integrated Management Team and the Policies and Programs Committee.

2. Submerged Lands Leasing Program

The OCMP has been working to improve the implementation of the submerged lands leasing program. During the evaluation period, the OCMP hired a professional surveyor to manage the coastal lands section. The OCMP has implemented a detailed and documented review process for all permit and lease applications with supporting technical review worksheets for review by decision-makers. The OCMP is working to develop a process to record executed submerged land leases at the county courthouse. Recording the leases will ensure that subsequent property owners are aware of the existing submerged lands lease associated with the property deed. During the evaluation period, the OCMP also documented operating procedures for lease billing and revenue collection and developed new delinquent payment procedures that are coordinated with the state attorney general's office.

ACCOMPLISHMENT: The OCMP has implemented improvements to the submerged lands leasing program.

3. Lake Erie Shore Erosion Management Plan and Coastal Design Manual

The OCMP has also begun work to develop a Lake Erie Shore Erosion Management Plan (LESEMP) that will identify partnerships between and among federal, state, and local governments and assist in addressing Lake-based erosion and flooding concerns. The LESEMP will be used by the Office of Coastal Management to support policy development that will focus on protecting and restoring valuable coastal resources and property. A NOAA Coastal Management Fellow is currently working with the OCMP to conduct a gap analysis and develop a model guidance document. The OCMP is also developing a coastal design manual which will assist property owners and consultants in identifying what information should be provided with a Coastal Permits and Lease Application and in understanding the criteria that the OCMP uses to review applications. When complete, both the LESEMP and the Coastal Design Manual will provide useful mechanisms for the OCMP to increase communications with local government and private property owners.

4. Public Participation

OCMP initiated the Ohio Coastal Atlas effort in the spring of 2004 and printed limited copies of its first edition in 2005. The second edition, released in 2007, improved and updated the

information, datasets, and mapping, partly based on comments received on the first edition from the general public, OCMP staff, and partners. The Atlas is meant to serve as a reservoir of information to help guide decision-makers in their daily efforts and provide valuable insight to people interested in Lake Erie and the coast of Ohio. The Atlas has been widely distributed to the public, decision-makers, and the educational community for various use and application. In addition, OCMP staff now use the internal office GIS capabilities that were developed to create the Atlas to provide technical assistance on individual projects.

ACCOMPLISHMENT: The OCMP has developed, updated, and disseminated the Ohio Coastal Atlas.

5. Coastal Resources Advisory Committee

During the review period the Coastal Resources Advisory Committee (CRAC) was reorganized, providing for more positive support of the OCMP. In 2005, the CRAC organized a two-day planning retreat to set priorities for the group. The CRAC has also developed several subcommittees to allow members to work on coastal issues at a more in-depth level. While this remains a “work in progress,” this momentum should not be lost.

PROGRAM SUGGESTION: The OCMP is encouraged to continue work supporting the development of the Coastal Resources Advisory Committee. In doing so, it might consider how similar bodies are constituted in other coastal states, such as Massachusetts and Maryland.

6. Coordination with Coastal Partners

As previously highlighted within several sections of this document, the OCMP has successfully collaborated with key coastal partners such as Ohio Sea Grant, ODNR Division of Soil and Water Conservation, Old Woman Creek National Estuarine Research Reserve (NERR), and the Lake Erie Commission. The OCMP has partnered with Ohio Sea Grant and the ODNR Division of Soil and Water Conservation to develop and implement the Ohio Clean Marina Program. The OCMP has provided both funding and staff support to the Lake Erie Commission’s Balanced Growth Initiative. Many partners both within and outside of ODNR were involved with the development of the Coastal Atlas and have also been engaged during the early stages of the LESEMP process. The OCMP has supported invasive species removal projects at Old Woman Creek, as well as other state nature preserves, and has continued to partner with the NERR and Sea Grant on the Ohio Coastal Training Program. NOAA encourages the OCMP to continue to develop strong working relationships with these coastal partners and to seek out opportunities to leverage resources and expertise towards the effective management of Ohio’s Lake Erie coastal zone.

7. Compliance Monitoring

The OCMP has not yet finalized a plan for increasing enforcement of and compliance with coastal regulations, even though the development of an enforcement plan was listed as a necessary action in the previous Section 312 evaluation findings. The OCMP has standardized internal office procedures to document public complaints regarding potentially non-compliant coastal construction or fill. As time permits, staff members are assigned to follow up on the complaints with a site visit. If necessary, a letter that explains the need to obtain authorizations and an application packet are sent to the property owner. However, in those cases where OCMP staff has not been able to resolve the issue, there has been no issuance of a “stop order” from the ODNR Director’s office. Since the previous evaluation, there has been no issuance of a compliance order, despite the fact that there have been numerous documented complaints each year from adjacent property owners and others. The ODNR should consider giving field inspection staff the authority to issue cease-and-desist orders to address the violations. Follow-up legal actions, including the assessment of financial penalties, can be taken from the Office of the Director of the ODNR and the State Attorney General’s Office.

Also, the OCMP has not addressed the issue of the numerous existing fill sites and structures that were either never authorized by the State, or did not fully comply with the lease and permit requirements. Both the 2005 and the 2000 Section 312 evaluation findings noted that the OCMP does not have an adequate follow-up system to determine whether permit conditions have been met. The OCMP could consider incorporating a permit requirement that applicants submit certified “as built” drawings after the permitted structure has been completed in order to easily verify that the permit requirements have been met. This might lessen the staff time required to ensure compliance with permit requirements. The OCMP should consider hiring a compliance officer to focus on this issue. However, the OCMP also needs to develop a plan to address the numerous existing fill sites and structures that were illegally constructed without any review or authorization by the State. For example, illegal fill and dumping of debris has the potential to pose a significant public safety hazard; and a poorly designed erosion control structure can accelerate and exacerbate existing erosion problems, on the site of the structure itself, as well as on adjacent properties. These problems must be addressed.

NECESSARY ACTION: A comprehensive monitoring and enforcement program must be developed that balances the interests of the public, protection of the resources of Lake Erie, and the interests of the upland property owners. The OCMP must submit a plan to OCRM on or before October 20, 2008, for increasing enforcement of, and compliance with, coastal regulations.

V. CONCLUSION

For the reasons stated herein, I find that the State of Ohio is adhering to the programmatic requirements of the Coastal Zone Management Act and its implementing regulations in the operation of its approved OCMP.

The OCMP has made notable progress in the following areas: Internal Office Processes, Communications and Outreach, Public Access, Coastal Habitat, Water Quality, Coastal Dependent Uses, and Government Coordination and Decision-making.

These evaluation findings also contain four (4) recommendations: one (1) Necessary Action that is mandatory and three (3) Program Suggestions. The state must address the Necessary Action by the date indicated. The Program Suggestions should be addressed before the next regularly scheduled program evaluation, but they are not mandatory at this time. Program Suggestions that must be repeated in subsequent evaluations may be elevated to Necessary Actions.

This is a programmatic evaluation of the OCMP that may have implications regarding the state's financial assistance awards. However, it does not make any judgment about or replace any financial audits.

4/11/08

Date

/signed/ David M. Kennedy

David M. Kennedy, Director

VI. APPENDICES

APPENDIX A. Summary of Accomplishments and Recommendations

The evaluation team documented a number of OCMP accomplishments during the review period. These include:

Issue Area	Accomplishment
Internal Office Processes	The OCMP has initiated or developed processes that are resulting in sound operation and management in the monitoring and tracking of coastal grants.
Communications and Outreach	The OCMP has developed a short-term outreach plan and has made a concerted effort to meet with local officials during the review period.
Public Access	OCMP has strongly supported the development of public access projects along the Lake Erie coast.
Coastal Habitat	OCMP partnered with local organizations to carry out preservation and restoration activities during the review period.
Water Quality	OCMP activities have supported the development of a clean marina program and nonpoint source pollution and watershed management efforts.
Coastal Dependent Uses	OCMP activities have supported the rehabilitation of a former Coast Guard station and the development of the master pedestrian and bicycle trail for the bayfront corridor of the City of Sandusky.
Policies and Program Committee	The OCMP has reactivated the Integrated Management Team and the Policies and Programs Committee.
Submerged Lands Leasing Program	The OCMP has implemented improvements to the submerged lands leasing program.
Public Participation	The OCMP has developed, updated, and disseminated the Ohio Coastal Atlas.

In addition to the accomplishments listed above, the evaluation team identified several areas where the program could be strengthened. Recommendations are in the forms of Program Suggestions and Necessary Actions. Areas for improvement include:

Issue Area	Recommendation
Communications and Outreach	PROGRAM SUGGESTION: The OCMP is encouraged to continue developing and implementing an office-wide communication plan that includes outreach components as well as continued communication with core constituent groups.
Communications and Outreach	PROGRAM SUGGESTION: The OCMP is encouraged to develop a user-friendly program document stressing the federal consistency process and how it is implemented in Ohio.
Coastal Resources Advisory Committee	PROGRAM SUGGESTION: The OCMP is encouraged to continue work supporting the development of the Coastal Resources Advisory Committee. In doing so, it might consider how similar bodies are constituted in other coastal states, such as Massachusetts and Maryland.
Compliance Monitoring	NECESSARY ACTION: A comprehensive monitoring and enforcement program must be developed that balances the interests of the public, protection of the resources of Lake Erie, and the interests of the upland property owners. The OCMP must submit a plan to OCRM on or before October 20, 2008, for increasing enforcement of, and compliance with, coastal regulations.

APPENDIX B. Response to Previous (2005) Evaluation Findings

Necessary Action: A coherent long term and short term strategy that effectively uses the capability of the networked coastal program and other coastal partners, and addresses the core authorities of the approved OCMP, must be developed and submitted to OCRM within six months of the receipt of these findings.

OCMP Response: OCM conducted a two day Strategic Planning workshop in September 2006 facilitated by ODNR Organizational Development. Based upon comments from various stakeholders, OCM established 5 main themes:

1. Existing Office Functions and Programs
2. Internal Operations
3. Coastal Resources Management Education and Outreach
4. Effective regulatory program
5. Protection and restoration of coastal resources

OCM is in the process of developing the framework established in November into a strategic plan and implementation/action plan for our Office. To date, some of the goals, objectives and strategies of an earlier draft document have been revised and consolidated. The revised draft has been distributed to Section Administrators for their input and updated content to reflect current ideology of our Office and Department. The timeline for completion is July 2007.

Necessary Action: A comprehensive examination of the enforcement of the coastal management regulations must be undertaken. The OCMP must develop a viable program of regulation to be carried out in concert with outreach to coastal local governments and the general public. The OCMP must submit a plan for increasing enforcement of and compliance with coastal regulations to OCRM within one year of the receipt of these findings.

OCMP Response: OCM created and implemented a set of procedures and related reporting forms to respond to public complaints regarding potentially unauthorized activities along the shore of Lake Erie. The procedures involve taking the complaint, assigning the complaint to a staff member for a site visit, and a follow-up by OCM with other regulatory agencies and/or the property owner. Electronic copies of these documents were submitted to NOAA in March, 2006.

Additionally, OCM created a draft regulatory enforcement plan to prioritize and outline responses to potential violations of the regulatory programs administered by the Office. After an internal review, it was decided that additional work on the draft plan would be required. To address this need, OCM partnered with the ODNR Division of Soil & Water Conservation to have one of their staff members, who previously played a key role in the Ohio Coastal Management Program, revise the draft plan. Currently, that effort is on hold, but OCM intends to resume work on the plan in the near future.

Necessary Action: The OCMP must submit all program changes to NOAA in accordance with OCRM's 1996 Final Program Change Guidance, including changes created by program

reorganization. Draft program changes must be submitted to OCRM for review within 6 months of receipt of these findings. In addition, in the event that Ohio passes legislation significantly changing the OCMP, Ohio must promptly submit these program changes to NOAA for review.

OCMP Response: Draft program changes were submitted to NOAA in August, 2005. These changes reflected the 2002 program reorganization, minor changes to rules, laws, and Federal financial assistance, the creation of the Ohio Clean Marinas Program, and implementation of Ohio’s Coastal Non-Point Pollution Control Program. After additional consultation with partner agencies, NOAA, the Coastal Resources Advisory Council, and the general public, a final routine program change was submitted in December, 2006, and the routine program change was approved by NOAA in April, 2007.

Program Suggestion: ODNR should move rapidly to complete the staffing of the OCM. Priority should be placed on filling all remaining positions, prioritizing mid-level management and natural resource management expertise, and providing appropriate training to staff members. In addition, internal and external operating procedures should be documented to provide institutional guidance over the long term.

OCMP Response: The ODNR Office of Coastal Management has addressed staffing issues by hiring the following staff since the last 312 evaluation:

<u>New Employee</u>	<u>Month Hired</u>	<u>Expertise, background, improvement contributed:</u>
Ackerman	11/04	Fiscal/Admin & Records Management
Kirkendall	12/06	Fiscal/Admin Reception
Ernst	1/05	Coastal Lands Supervisor
Kosek-Sills	hired perm.	CELCP Coordinator
Everhard	7/04	Executive Secretary to Chief
Lagrou	11/06	Coastal Lands Real Estate Specialist
Watkins	promotion to	Chief
Wright	11/04	Resources Specialist
Lawrence	8/04	Natural Resource Engineer
George	hired perm.	GIMS2

Training

Internal and external operating procedures have been documented to provide long term institutional guidance by establishing and documenting the following procedures:

- Standard Operating Procedures
- Fiscal/Admin Procedures are documented and continually updated in the Fiscal Procedures Manual
- Regulatory Review Process Procedures
- Submerged Land Lease Billing Procedures
- Submerged Land Lease Delinquent Payment Procedures (AG Collections)
- Submerged Land Lease Revenue Collection Procedures
- Short Term Outreach Plan (STOP)

- Records Management
- Coastal Management Assistance Grants Booklet

Pending: *Regulatory decision procedures
 *Implementation of Grant Tracking Database – also shared database template with other coastal programs
 *Implementation of Ohio Administrative Knowledge System (OAKS)

Program Suggestion: ODNR/OCM should prepare a definitive administration policy statement on submerged land leasing issues and the Lake Erie Public Trust boundary. A public outreach campaign to educate coastal residents about state policies on submerged lands should also be undertaken. ODNR may want to consider establishing a “blue ribbon” panel of experts on submerged lands policy to provide guidance on this issue.

OCMP Response: On May 28, 2004, two lawsuits seeking to define the state of Ohio’s territory in Lake Erie were filed in Lake County Common Pleas Court against the State of Ohio Department of Natural Resources (DNR). Both similarly worded lawsuits were later combined and titled *State of Ohio Ex Rel., Robert Merrill, et al. v. State of Ohio Department of Natural Resources, et al.*, (Case No. 04CV 001080) and commonly referred to as the Merrill-Taft case. The National Wildlife Federation and the Ohio Environmental Council both asked to be joined to the lawsuit as defendants.

In June 2006, the lawsuit was certified as a class action, with the class consisting of all littoral owners along Ohio’s coast except the State of Ohio and any State agency. The lawsuit seeks to define the terms natural shoreline and southerly shore; define the State’s territory in Lake Erie; and, define public and private rights in the territory. The Ohio Attorney General’s Office is representing the DNR.

Program Suggestion: The OCM should improve communication and coordination with agencies and coastal partners at the local, State, and Federal levels, including internal communication among ODNR programs. The OCM should consider recreating the Integrated Management Team that was in place prior to 2001.

OCMP Response: During the past three years, the Office of Coastal Management has made a concerted effort to increase outreach to coastal constituents including to local government officials, target audiences, and the general public. To accomplish this endeavor, the Office has used a multifaceted approach including presentations, tradeshow appearances, and organized forums.

The Integrated Management Team was reactivated in 2004, and quarterly meetings have taken place continuously since that reactivation. The quarterly meetings are attended by key staff, including some Chiefs, of a majority of ODNR’s divisions, including Geological Survey, Natural Areas & Preserves, Parks & Recreation, Real Estate & Land Management, Soil & Water Conservation, Water, Watercraft, and Wildlife.

The Policies and Program Committee, consisting of the State agencies that are networked into the Ohio Coastal Management Program, was reactivated in 2006, and the meetings are scheduled to be held semiannually. The first meeting held after the reactivation took place in August, 2006. The PPC consists of key staff members of the Ohio Historic Preservation Office, Ohio Lake Erie Commission, Ohio Environmental Protection Agency, and the Ohio Departments of Agriculture, Development, Health, and Transportation.

Aside from the scheduled meetings for the IMT and PPC, the groups are regularly sent relevant information and requests for comments (i.e. draft strategic plans, training opportunities, grant information, program change, etc.) by OCM. The PPC members serve as their respective agencies' liaison to the Ohio Coastal Management Program.

In 2005, the Office of Coastal Management hosted a series of six Coastal Counties Forums across Ohio's 312-mile coast. Local decision-makers throughout each of the nine coastal counties were invited to the meetings, which allowed for a two-way information exchange between Federal, State and local officials. The Office of Coastal Management invited partner agencies to give presentations at the meetings and address local decision-makers' concerns. Local decision-makers were also able to discuss ideas and initiatives that they feel are important for improving Ohio's coastal resources and providing economic benefit to their communities. Coastal Resource Advisory Council (CRAC) members from their respective counties were also encouraged to attend the meetings and serve as a liaison between local decision-makers and the Office throughout the year.

In 2006 the Office of Coastal Management implemented a short-term outreach plan which included giving presentations to local government associations, homeowners groups and boating groups. In addition to numerous presentations, the Office of Coastal Management hosted a week-long display in coordination with the Ohio Clean Marinas Program at the Cedar Point In-Water Boat Show, reached more than 800 visitors to Stone Lab with a display there during Ohio Sea Grant's annual open house, and participated in the 2006 NERRA/ NERRS Annual Conference hosted by Old Woman Creek.

The Office of Coastal Management's outreach efforts continued in 2007 with a new hands-on display which was unveiled at the 2007 Cleveland Boat and Waterfront Lifestyles Expo, a 10-day event held at the Cleveland I-X Center. The display featured 20 boxes representing shore samples from across Ohio's coast. The display was arranged to correspond with the shape of Ohio's coast and information boards about the benefits of the Ohio Coastal Management Program, Coastal Nonpoint Pollution Control Program, Coastal and Estuarine Land Conservation Program and information regarding Lake Erie and the Great Lakes displayed behind. More than 75 people signed up for the *Ohio Coastal Atlas, Second Edition* and countless children and adults literally dug into the display. Additional efforts include participating in the Erie County Nature and Science Network, distributing the *Ohio Coastal Atlas*, creating and distributing the Grants Booklet (1998-2006), and planning events for Cleveland School Days to be hosted at Edgewater State Park.

Program Suggestion: OCM should develop a clear and concise description of the Federal

consistency process in the State and distribute it to Federal, State and local agencies and the public.

OCMP Response: In 2004, OCM developed a flowchart that shows the steps involved in reviewing Federal consistency certifications and determinations. The flowchart provides a visual representation of the relationship between the environmental reviews conducted by ODNR staff in Columbus and the application of the results of those reviews to OCM's consistency reviews. The flowchart is accompanied by a text document which explains each step of the review process. Additionally, the consistency flowchart is located within a larger document that also contains flowcharts of the reviews related to the three other regulatory programs administered by OCM.

The documents were handed out in 2005 to the U.S. Army Corps of Engineers and Ohio EPA during meetings that focused on the draft combined permit application. The flowcharts were also distributed in 2006 to the Integrated Management Team, Policies and Programs Committee, and Coastal Resources Advisory Council.

Program Suggestion: The OCMP should work with the Department of Real Estate and Land Management and other agencies to identify ways to better use the Lake Erie Geographic Information System. The OCMP should also consult with coastal partners such as Sea Grant, Old Woman Creek NERRS, and the Lake Erie Commission to determine how the proposed coastal atlas can best serve these potential coastal constituents and ensure limited duplication of effort.

OCMP Response: OCM has actively worked with the Office of Information Technology to identify data gaps; develop strategies to work with other DNR Divisions and outside coastal partners; enhance existing datasets; and implement an Internet Map Server (IMS) for access to the general public. This IMS was subjected to a three month beta-testing period and comments from users were integrated to enable straightforward delivery of data. The IMS was made available to the general public, including governmental decision-makers, in September 2005. Refinements targeted to add data layers and webpage design and layout continue to occur.

The coordination of these efforts to leverage partnerships with coastal agencies also led to a separate link on OCM's website to the First Edition of the Coastal Atlas. In April 2007, OCM updated its website to replace the First Edition Coastal Atlas with the Second Edition Coastal Atlas.

OCM has incorporated these datasets from many of the divisions and offices within ODNR into GIS projects for each of the counties within the Lake Erie watershed. In each of the nine coastal counties, there are no fewer than 180 data layers available within the GIS projects which are generally used by regulatory review staff and managers. Many of the data layers maintained on the server are watershed-wide, and most are available to the public upon request and without cost.

Program Suggestion: The OCMP should develop an outreach plan designed to clearly

articulate the program's goals and objectives to the residents of the coastal area. This outreach program should prioritize the dissemination of factual information that will increase public awareness of coastal issues and processes.

OCMP Response: In 2004, the Office of Coastal Management completed the first Coastal Outreach and Public Education plan (COPE). COPE sets forth goals, strategies and timelines for providing information to coastal communities and decision-makers regarding Lake Erie, coastal resources and the Ohio Coastal Management Program in order to enhance the lives of Ohioans and countless others living in and visiting the Great Lakes ecosystem.

COPE's two main goals are to increase protection, restoration and enhancement of Ohio's coastal resources; and to increase public and private knowledge of the Ohio Coastal Management Program and Office of Coastal Management. Under these two goals are objectives relating to: understanding a coastal region's ecosystem and the economic benefit to local economies, improving communications to better meet constituents' needs, promoting Great Lakes ecosystem recognition, increasing grant information exchange, and improving education materials, outreach and training regarding coastal regulations and environmental laws.

During the past three year, OCM has taken strides to implement the COPE plan with activities such as creating the first and second editions of the *Ohio Coastal Atlas*, creating the Grants Booklet, making progress on the Lake Erie Shore Erosion Management Plan, designing and displaying information boards at trade shows and conferences, updating the Office of Coastal Management web pages, improving coordination with Great Lakes states, and state and local partner agencies, and improving communication with local decision-makers in the coastal region.

Program Suggestion: ODNR should undertake a thorough analysis of the role of the Coastal Resources Advisory Committee to make recommendations for improving the CRAC's role in the implementation of the OCMP and to develop actions to increase the council's effectiveness, including increased use of the CRAC in public outreach efforts and as a policy "sounding board."

OCMP Response: In February 2005 the Coastal Resources Advisory Council held a two-day planning retreat to establish a list of priorities to address over the next two years. In addition, the Council established six sub-committees including an executive committee that meets prior to each CRAC meeting. Each priority has been assigned to a committee for monitoring. The list of priorities has also served as a guide in choosing the educational presentations that are conducted at each meeting. Lastly, a new agenda structure was implemented with time allotments for each topic. This has helped keep meetings on track, resulting in more productive meetings.

APPENDIX C. Persons and Institutions Contacted

Ohio Department of Natural Resources

Sean Logan	Director
Glen Alexander	Assistant Director
Cathryn Loucas	Deputy Director
Cynthia Frazzini	Legal Services Chief Counsel
Charles Rowan	Legal Services Deputy Chief Counsel
Mike Shelton	Legislative Services Chief
Vicki Diesner	Director's Office
Christie Wilt	Office of Communications Chief
Matt Adkins	Division of Soil and Water
Dave Hanselmann	Division of Soil and Water
Greg Nageotte	Division of Soil and Water
Paul Baldrige	Division of Real Estate and Land Management
Brian Mitch	Division of Real Estate and Land Management
Bob Gable	Division of Natural Areas and Preserves
Steve Maurer	Division of Natural Areas and Preserves
Larry Wickstrom	Division of Geological Survey
Connie Livchak	Division of Geological Survey
Roger Knight	Division of Wildlife
Phil Miller	Division of Watercraft
Mark Ogden	Division of Water
Mark Ervin	Division of Forestry
Frank Lopez	Old Woman Creek National Estuarine Research Reserve
John Watkins	Office of Coastal Management Chief
Steve Holland	Office of Coastal Management
Liz Everhard	Office of Coastal Management
Lynette Berkey	Office of Coastal Management
Chris Shaw	Office of Coastal Management
Gene Wright	Office of Coastal Management
Sandra Kosek-Sills	Office of Coastal Management
Yetty Alley	Office of Coastal Management
Joyce Hackett	Office of Coastal Management
Patrick Ernst	Office of Coastal Management

Other State and Federal Agencies

Brad Biggs	Ohio Department of Development
Steve Binns	Ohio Department of Health
Mark Epstein	Ohio Historic Preservation Office
Bill Goodman	Ohio Department of Agriculture

Other State and Federal Agencies (continued)

Julie Letterhos	Ohio Environmental Protection Agency
Emily Miller	Ohio Department of Transportation
Karol Fox	Ohio Office of Attorney General
Rich Ruby	U.S. Army Corps of Engineers, Buffalo District

Coastal Resources Advisory Committee

Rodney Althaus, Ottawa County
Jim Barchok, Lake County
John Born, Lorain County
Tom Denbow, Cuyahoga County
Eric Dodrill, Erie County
George Goudreau, Jr., Cuyahoga County
Joseph Hayberger, Erie County
Patrick Hayes, Erie County
Dr. Robert Health, Portage County
Jim Kastelic, Cuyahoga County, Chairperson
John Keenan, Ashtabula County
David Miesmer, Wood County
Jim O'Connor, Lorain County
David Spotts, Ashtabula County
Maggie Thurber, Lucas County, Vice-chairperson
Vince Urbanski, Lake County

Other Organizations and Representatives

Jim Kastelic	Cleveland Metroparks
Lynn Garrity	Cuyahoga Soil and Water Conservation District
Jan Rybka	Cuyahoga Soil and Water Conservation District
Dr. Jeff Reutter	Ohio Sea Grant College Program Director
Gary Comer	Ohio Sea Grant-Clean Marina Program Coordinator
Carrie Hansen	City of Cleveland
Bob Brown	City of Cleveland
Neil Allen	Sandusky Maritime Museum Director
Gary Packan	City of Sandusky Assistant City Manager
Ed Hammett	Ohio Lake Erie Commission Executive Director
Melinda Huntley	Lake Erie Coastal Ohio Executive Director
Dr. John Holomuzki	Ohio State University-Mansfield
Dr. Robert Whyte	California University of Pennsylvania

APPENDIX D. Persons Attending the Public Meeting

The Public Meeting was held on Wednesday, May 16, 2007, at 7:00 p.m., in the Erie County Commissioners Chambers. The following attended the meeting:

Attendee:	Representing:
Eric Dodrill	Erie SWCD
Cindy Brookes	Sandusky River Watershed Council
John Katko	Friends Of Wet Lands/Ohio Environmental Council

APPENDIX E. NOAA's Response to Written Comments

NOAA received one written comment regarding the Ohio Coastal Management Program. The letter is part of the official record of the evaluation and is briefly summarized below, followed by NOAA's response.

John Katko
Member of the Board of Directors, Ohio Environmental Council
President, Friends of Wetlands
Elyria, Ohio

Comment: Mr. Katko's comments were read and received at the public meeting. Mr. Katko's letter states that the Ohio Environmental Council and Friends of Wetlands strongly support the efforts of the OCMP to protect the public trust rights of the public. Mr. Katko also expressed his organization's general support of the OCMP and the goals of the program but noted that he would like to see the states Coastal Zone Management Plan used to aggressively protect, enhance, and restore coastal habitats within Sandusky Bay and to better manage human activities along the Bay.

NOAA's Response: OCRM thanks Mr. Katko for his comments. The OCMP is continuing to strive to improve its management of Ohio's coastal zone. In regard to Mr. Katko's comments about the need to address the impacts of human activities on the alongshore sediment transport and deposition processes, the OCMP has begun developing a Lake Erie Shore Erosion Management Plan that will be used to support policy development focusing on the protection and restoration of valuable coastal resources. The OCMP also has the lead role in the State's implementation of the Coastal and Estuarine Land Conservation Program (CELCP), which provides state and local governments with matching funds to purchase significant coastal and estuarine lands, or conservation easements on such lands, from willing sellers.